

ORDINANCE NO. 2021-XX

AN ORDINANCE OF THE CITY COMMISSION OF ST. AUGUSTINE, FLORIDA, AMENDING CHAPTER 28, SECTION 28-2 ADDING DEFINITIONS RELATED TO ARCHITECTURAL TERMS, DEMOLITION AND RELOCATION; AMENDING CHAPTER 28, SECTION 28-89 REVISING AND CLARIFYING CRITERIA FOR THE REVIEW OF CERTIFICATE OR OPINION OF APPROPRIATENESS, RELOCATION OR DEMOLITION; AMENDING CHAPTER 28, SECTION 28-90 ADDING REFERENCE TO PARTIAL DEMOLITION; PROVIDING FOR INCLUSION IN THE CODE OF THE CITY OF ST. AUGUSTINE; AND PROVIDING FOR AN EFFECTIVE DATE.

WHEREAS, § 166.041, Florida Statutes, provides for procedures for the adoption of ordinances and resolutions by municipalities; and

WHEREAS, the City of St. Augustine is recognized as the Nation's Oldest City; and

WHEREAS, the intent of the City's Comprehensive Plan, Historic Preservation Master Plan, and implementing land development codes and architectural guidelines are to preserve and protect historic structures, and the nature and character of the City's historic neighborhoods; and

WHEREAS, the City Commission, the Historic Architectural Review Board, and the Planning and Zoning Board are aware that new development, code requirements, full and partial demolitions, and relocations of structures can contribute to a change in the character of the historic downtown and historic neighborhoods of the City; and

WHEREAS, the historic assets of the city contribute to the character of residential neighborhoods, quality of life, and equate to an economic value of \$2.9 billion dollars according to the 2020 publication *Resilient Heritage in the Nation's Oldest City*; and

WHEREAS, on **July 6, 2021** the Planning and Zoning Board acting as the designated land planning agency for the City of St. Augustine recommended the included additions and revisions to Chapter 28, the Zoning Code to the City Commission; and

WHEREAS, the City Commission for the City of St. Augustine finds that it is in the best interest of public health, safety, and general welfare that the following amendments be adopted consistent with the requirements of Section 166.021(4), Florida Statutes.

NOW, THEREFORE, BE IT ORDAINED BY THE CITY COMMISSION FOR THE CITY OF ST. AUGUSTINE, FLORIDA, AS FOLLOWS:

Section 1. Amendment to Chapter 28, Article I, Section 28-2. Chapter 28, Article I, Section 28-2 is hereby amended, as follows:

“Sec. 28-2. - Definitions.

For the purpose of this chapter, certain words and terms used herein shall be interpreted to have meanings as defined below. Where words or terms are not defined, they shall have their ordinarily accepted meanings or such as the context may imply. Words used in the present tense include the future; the singular number includes the plural and the plural includes the singular. The word "shall" is mandatory; the word "may" is permissive. The word "used" or "occupied" includes the words "intended, designed or arranged to be used or occupied." The word "lot" includes the word "plot" or "parcel." The word "structure" includes the word "building" as well as other things constructed or erected on the ground, attached to something having location on the ground, or requiring construction or erection on the ground. The word "land" includes the word "marsh," "water" or "swamp." The word "map" shall mean the "Zoning Maps of the City of St. Augustine, Florida" and the "city" shall mean the City of St. Augustine, Florida, a corporation of the State of Florida.

...

Archaeological preservation ordinance refers to Chapter 6 of the St. Augustine Code of Ordinances which identifies archaeological zones the requires archaeological review when the threshold of ground disturbance activity is met or exceeded with development and utility permits.

...

Architectural feature includes but is not limited to the following: architectural style, scale, massing, siting, general design, and general arrangement of the exterior of the building or structure; type and texture of exterior materials; size, type, placement, and patterns of roof(s), windows, doors, and all attached appurtenances including porches, stairs and stoop features, dormers, additions, trim details, balconies and railings or other decorative attachments.

...

Architecturally similar means having substantially the same façade design or exterior appearance using like characteristics in terms of height, mass, scale, footprint, arrangement of openings, pattern and materials.

...

Contributing property a building, site, structure or object which adds to the historical architectural qualities, historic associations or archaeological values for which a district is significant because (a) it was present during the period of significance of the district and possesses historic integrity reflecting its character at that time; (b) is capable of yielding important information about the period; or (c) it independently meets the National Register of Historic Places criteria for evaluation.

...

Design compatibility refers to new construction or alterations to a historic building or setting that preserves significant materials, features and form, and preserves the building's historic character. For alteration to a historic building, repairs using historic materials is preferred; however, there are circumstances where substitute materials that imitate historic materials may be used if the appearance and properties of the historic materials can be matched closely and no damage to the remaining historic fabric will result.

...

Façade includes the face of a building and is most commonly referred to as a street façade and/or visible façade.

...

Historic character refers to all visual aspects and physical features that comprise the appearance of historic properties and extends to the setting of historic properties to include a building's relationship to the environment and adjacent streets and buildings, landscape plantings, views, and the presence of accessory features.

Historic integrity is the authenticity of a property's identity, evidenced by the survival of physical characteristics that existed during the property's historic period including evaluation of any changes that may have occurred through time which could contribute to the building's later-acquired historic character and significance. An overall sense of past time and place are evident in the composite of seven qualities: location, design, setting, materials, workmanship, feeling and association.

Historic period is the primary timeline for which the historic building derived its historic association with an event, person, place, pattern of development or other context.

...

In-kind features or materials means using architecturally similar material and design to convey the visual appearance of the remaining parts of the feature and finish.

...

Material deficiency refers to the inability of the building material, or a majority of building materials that comprise a feature or structure, to serve its purpose and documented as beyond repair.

...

National Register of Historic Places is the list of historic properties significant in American history, architectural, archaeology, engineering and culture maintained by the Secretary of the Interior, as established by the National Historic Preservation Act of 1966, as amended. May be significant at the local, state or federal level.

...

Preservation the act or process of applying measures necessary to sustain the existing form, integrity, and materials of an historic property. Work, including preliminary measures to protect and stabilize the property, generally focuses upon the ongoing maintenance and repair of historic materials and features rather than extensive replacement and new construction.

...

Reconstruction the act or process of depicting, by means of new construction, the form, features, and detailing of a non-surviving site, landscape, building, structure, or object for the purpose of replicating its appearance at a specific period of time and in its historic location.

...

Rehabilitation the act or process of returning a property to a state of utility through repair or alteration which makes possible an efficient contemporary use while preserving those portions or features of the property which are significant to its historical, architectural, cultural and archaeological values.

...

Relocation the act of moving a building from its original location to another site, either on the same property or to another location entirely.

...

Restoration the act or process of accurately recovering the form and details of a property and its setting as it appeared at a particular period of time by means of removal of later work or by the replacement of missing earlier work.

...

Routine maintenance and repair in terms of historic preservation means using the same materials in a way that matches the architectural style of the existing building.

...

Significant architectural feature is an architectural feature(s) that comprises the historic character of the structure and built near the same time as the building or added features and alterations that maintain the historic character of the building.

...

Technical requirement refers to performance mandates established by local, state or federal governments and their supporting regulatory documents.

...”

Section 2. Amendment to Chapter 28, Article II, Section 28-89. Chapter 28, Article II, Section 28-89 is hereby amended, as follows:

“Sec. 28-89. - Criteria for certificate or opinion of appropriateness, relocation or demolition review.

The criteria for opinion of appropriateness, certificate of appropriateness, relocation or demolition review shall be as follows:

(1) In reviewing an application ~~for a certificate of appropriateness~~, the board and/or building official and/or planning director shall consider the design and appearance of the structure, including ~~the interior visible from the outside~~, front, sides, rear and roof; materials, textures and colors; plat plan or site layout, including features such as walls, walks, terraces, plantings, accessory structures, signs, lights, awnings, canopies, and other appurtenances. The decision to approve or deny the proposed work ~~issue or not to issue the certificate~~ shall be based on the conformance of the proposed work to the Architectural Guidelines for Historical Preservation (AGHP) or applicable entry corridor design standards of the City of St. Augustine as from time to time promulgated by the historic architectural review board or the city commission and approved by ordinance of the city commission, hereinafter referred to as 'AGHP,' and Albert Manucy's Houses of St. Augustine - 1565-1821, and the Design Standards for Entry Corridors. ~~When reviewing a certificate of relocation of a structure, consideration will be given to the immediate surroundings and to the district or districts in which it is located or to be located.~~ The board shall not exercise any control over land use, such as governed by this chapter, or over

construction, such as is governed by the building code, unless such control is within the intent and scope of this chapter.

a. In the case of an opinion of appropriateness HARB shall make a determination that the general concept, preliminary construction plans, details or specifications of a project meet the architectural requirements of the AGHP, but that the information may be insufficient to meet the requirements of a certificate of appropriateness or to obtain a building permit.

b. In the case of a certificate of appropriateness HARB shall make a final determination that the details are sufficient, construction plans are complete, and details and specifications for a project meet the AGHP requirements. A certificate of appropriateness is required before a building permit may be issued. Only those plans and details approved by HARB may be reviewed by the Building Official during the building permit review process.

c. In the case of a certificate of relocation of a structure consideration will be given to the immediate surroundings and to the district or districts in which it is located or to be located, that the relocation of the structure will not adversely impact the city's historic preservation efforts or negatively affect the streetscape. If the building is going to be relocated on the same site, or moved to a new site in a locally designated historic preservation zoning district, then the process and plan requirements for a certificate of appropriateness also apply to the building's new location.

d. In the case of a certificate of demolition or partial demolition a determination is made that the demolition of the structure will not adversely impact the city's historic preservation efforts. The applicant may also be required to submit information on the structural condition of the building from an engineer or architect to justify the need for demolishing the structure.

(2) Before approving the plans for any proposed structure or signs located or to be located in a district, the board shall find:

a. In the case of a proposed alteration or addition to an existing structure, that such alteration or addition will not materially impair the architectural or historic value of the structure.

b. In the case of a proposed new structure, that such structure will not, in itself or by reason of its location on the site, materially impair the architectural or historic value of a structure on adjacent sites or in the immediate vicinity.

c. In the case of a proposed new structure, that such structure will not be injurious to the general visual character of the district or districts in which it is to be located.

d. In the case of the proposed demolition of an existing structure, that the removal of such structure will not be detrimental to the historic and architectural character of the city or that, balancing the interest of the city in preserving the integrity of the city and interest of the owner of the property, approval of the plans for demolition in the latter event the board may issue an order ~~to~~ postponing demolition for a period of not to exceed twelve (12) months after which the owner must reapply. The board may issue a second postponement with the total postponement period not to exceed two (2) twelve (12) month periods. If the board concludes that the demolition should be postponed, it shall, before issuing any final order with respect to such postponement, afford the applicant an opportunity to appear before the board to offer any evidence ~~he~~ they may desire to present

concerning the proposed order. Within the period of postponement, the board shall ascertain what the city or other agency or organization may do to preserve such structure and shall make recommendations to that effect to the city commission or otherwise cause the structure to be preserved. This section shall not apply to any permit for demolition which has been applied for, in proper form, prior to the effective date of this section. If the building or structure is of exceptional significance, is a contributing property to a National Register of Historic Places District or has been individually listed on the National Register of Historic Places, the board can deny the demolition if the board finds the removal of such building or structure will be detrimental to the historic and architectural character of the city and the applicant has not proven the denial will cause an undue economic hardship. The destruction of colonial buildings listed on the Florida Master Site File, designated Local Landmarks, or buildings meeting the criteria for eligibility on the National Register of Historic Places must be approved by the city commission.

Additional application requirements:

1. The owner shall permit access to the subject property for the purpose of inspections and/or appraisals required by the board or preservation officer.
2. Signs required. The planning and building department shall cause a sign or signs to be posted on any land upon which an application with respect to relocation or demolition has been made not less than seven (7) days in advance of the date of the public hearing at which such application is to be considered. Such sign shall show the date of construction of the existing building and be erected in full view of the public on each street side of such land. Where such land does not have frontage on a public street, such signs shall be erected on the nearest street right-of-way with an attached notation indicating generally the direction and distance to the land concerning which a public hearing is scheduled. Such sign shall be posted in full view of the public and shall be maintained by the applicant until final determination has been made by the board or city commission.
3. Mailed notices. Not less than ten (10) days in advance of the date of the required public hearing(s) at which an application for a certificate of demolition is to be considered, the time and place of the public hearing shall be posted by United States mail by the applicant to all owners of real property within one hundred fifty (150) feet of the boundaries of the land upon which the application is made. For the purpose of notice requirements to adjoining owners within one hundred fifty (150) feet, the names and addresses shall include information obtained from the St. Johns County Property Appraiser records within ninety (90) days prior to the application date. Such list prepared for any required public hearing with the historic architectural review board, if appealed, shall also be used for a required public hearing with the city commission. A record of the date on which the list was compiled shall be provided to and maintained by the planning and building department.
4. Applications for a certificate of demolition, including partial demolition shall be presented to the historic architectural review board by the property owner or representative.
5. Applications for partial demolition of buildings listed in the National Register of Historic Places, contributing to a historic district in the National Register of Historic

Places, listed as a local landmark pursuant to this code, listed as a potential landmark identified in the Historic Preservation Element of the Comprehensive Plan, Master Plan or identified by historic preservation planning staff as culturally significant within the recent past, may apply for the demolition of additional components of the building as part of a more comprehensive rehabilitation plan. Staff may require that the application be reviewed as a full demolition, however it may be recognized that applicants may encounter unforeseen building damage, site conditions, flood mitigation obstacles, or other significant and demonstrable reasons justifying a more extensive partial demolition as part of the rehabilitation. As a condition of In issuing a certificate of demolition/partial demolition, the board may include approval of both the partial demolition and potential related additional demolition and its require the rehabilitated replacement design under one application be approved by the board and that no permit be issued for the demolition of said structure until This will allow the approval of drawings sufficient for a building permit and that all necessary requirements for the new construction of a new building related to the partial demolition have been are submitted for the new construction permitting review and approval.

6. As a condition of issuing a certificate of demolition, including partial demolition the board may require, at the applicant's expense, salvage and preservation of significant building materials, architectural details and ornaments, fixtures, and the like for reuse in restoration of other historic properties. The board may also require at the applicant's expense the recording of the structure for archival purposes prior to demolition. The recording may include, but shall not be limited to, photographs and measured drawings.

7. If an owner/applicant fails to appear for three historic architectural review board meetings, the application may be considered as withdrawn.

e. In the case of any proposed new or altered sign, that the sign will not materially impair the architectural or historic value of any structure to which it is attached, nor any adjacent structure, and that such sign is consistent with the architecture of the building and the historical character of the area.

f. The board shall not have the authority to consider interior arrangements.

...”

Section 3. Amendment to Chapter 28, Article II, Section 28-90. Chapter 28, Article I, Section 28-2 is hereby amended, as follows:

“Sec. 28-90. - Administration and records.

(a) Any necessary building or demolition permit and/or certificate of occupancy shall not be issued unless the building official and/or the planning director and/or the historic architectural review board approves the application for a certificate of appropriateness. Such permit shall be subject to the terms of such approval as well as other necessary provisions of this Code.

(b) Applications for certificates of appropriateness shall be submitted through the office of the building official and/or planning director and shall include, in duplicate, all plans, elevations and other information necessary to determine the appropriateness of the features to be passed upon.

(c) Prior to issuance or denial of a certificate of appropriateness required by the board, the board shall take such action as may reasonably be required to inform the owners of any property likely to be materially affected by the application and shall give the applicant and such owners an opportunity to be heard. The board shall hold a public hearing concerning each application.

(d) Every decision of the board and/or building official and/or planning director in passing upon plans for structures or signs located or to be located in the district shall be in the form of a written order stating the finding of the board, its decisions and reasons therefor.

(e) The board shall not disapprove any plans without giving its recommendations for changes necessary to be made before the plans will be reconsidered. Such recommendations may be general in scope, and compliance with them shall qualify the plans for reconsideration by the board.

(f) An appeal may, within thirty (30) days thereafter, be taken by any aggrieved person to the city commission from the board's action in granting or denying an opinion or certificate of appropriateness, relocation or demolition. The appeal shall be as prescribed in section 28-29(g). Any appeal from the decision of the city commission shall be heard by the circuit court of the county, on writ of certiorari, as in the case of any other zoning decision from the city commission. All orders to approve certificates of demolition, except for partial demolition, shall become effective on the 31st day following the date of the rendered order, unless this waiting period is specifically granted a written waiver by the city commission or city manager. The owner-applicant of an order to approve a demolition certificate may request a hardship waiver to the city manager for emergency humanitarian reasons including the health and safety of the occupants of a structure in need of immediate emergency repairs, renovation or reconstruction. In the alternative, the owner-applicant of an order to approve a demolition certificate may request a waiver from the city commission if the delay in demolishing the structure would create an undue burden on the owner-applicant that would be greater than the public interest served in preserving the thirty-day waiting period. All decisions to grant or deny the waiver shall be rendered in writing within five days of the decision, mailed by standard U.S. mail to the owner-applicant and posted on the city's website. The decision of the city manager or city commission shall serve as the final administrative appeal of the waiting period.

(g) Any decision of the historic architectural review board certified by the planning director to be in conflict with a determination or decision of the planning and zoning board or of the board of adjustments and appeals; shall be reviewed by the city commission in the same manner as an appeal and the commission shall review the determination of the historic architectural review board, and the decision of the planning and zoning board or board of adjustments and appeals as to which it is certified to be in conflict and shall determine whether the decision of the historic architectural review board should be affirmed, modified or reversed and the decision of the commission shall supersede the decision reviewed. All affected persons shall be notified of the hearing by the city commission in the same manner as that provided for appeals from decisions of the planning and zoning board. The hearing before the commission shall be de novo.”

Section 4. Inclusion in Code. The City Commission intends that the provisions of this ordinance shall become and shall be made part of the Code of the City of St. Augustine, that repealed language shall be removed and that the sections of this ordinance may be re-numbered or re-lettered and that the word ordinance may be changed to section, article or other such appropriate word or phrase in order to accomplish such intentions.

Section 5. Conflict with Other Ordinances. All ordinances or parts of ordinances in conflict herewith are hereby repealed.

Section 6. Severance of Invalid Provisions. If any section, subsection, sentence, clause, phrase, word or provision of this ordinance is held to be invalid or unconstitutional by a court of competent jurisdiction, then said holding shall not be so construed as to render invalid or unconstitutional the remaining provisions of this ordinance.

Section 7. Effective Date. This ordinance shall become effective ten (10) days after passage, pursuant to § 166.041(4), Florida Statutes.

PASSED by the City Commission of the City of St. Augustine, Florida, this _____ day of _____, 2021.

ATTEST:

Tracy Upchurch, Mayor-Commissioner

Darlene Galambos, City Clerk
(SEAL)