

CITY OF ST. AUGUSTINE

Historic Architectural Review Board Regular Meeting
April 19, 2018

The Historic Architectural Review Board met in formal session at 1:00 P.M., Thursday, April 19, 2018, in the Alcazar Room at City Hall, St. Augustine, Florida. Catharine Duncan, Acting Chairperson, called the regular meeting to order, and the following were present:

1. ROLL CALL: Catherine Duncan, Vice-Chairperson
Barbara Wingo
Jon Benoit
Peter Rumpel – Alternate

Absent: Toni Wallace, excused

City Staff: Jenny Wolfe, Historic Preservation Officer
Kelli Mitchell, Historic Preservation Planner
Isabelle Lopez, City Attorney
Candice Seymour, Recording Secretary

2. General Public Comments for Items not on the Agenda

(None)

3. Approval of Minutes

MOTION

Ms. Wingo **MOVED** to **APPROVE** the **March 15, 2018 minutes** as presented and the motion was **APPROVED BY UNANIMOUS VOICE VOTE.**

4. Modification and approval of Agenda

Ms. Wolfe noted that item 6(a) had been withdrawn and the applicant for item 6(d) had requested a continuance prior to the meeting.

The Board provided their ex parte communications for item 6(d).

MOTION

Mr. Benoit **MOVED** to **APPROVE** the **modifications to the Agenda. Motion SECONDED** by Mr. Rumpel.

VOTE ON MOTION:

AYES: Benoit, Rumpel, Wingo, Duncan

NAYES: NONE

MOTION CARRIED UNANIMOUSLY

MOTION

Mr. Benoit **MOVED** to **CONTINUE** application F2017-0153 to the **May 24, 2018 meeting.** The motion **SECONDED** by Ms. Wingo **APPROVED BY UNANIMOUS VOICE VOTE .**

5. Public Comments related to Expedited Hearing items:

After staff reports for all items were read into the record, public hearing was opened.

Richard Baker, applicant for item 5(b) asked a question regarding landscaping on his property at 36 Treasury Street, agreed to staff conditions, and waived his presentation.

Les Thomas, representing the applicant for item 5(a), agreed to staff's conditions and waived his presentation.

Public hearing was closed.

**5. (a) Certificate of Appropriateness
F2018-0029 – Ralph Molinari – Applicant
and Owner
166 Avenida Menendez**

To raise the existing building, build a first floor balcony on the east side of the building, and build a porch on the east side of the building.

Ms. Mitchell read the staff report and said based on a review of the AGHP and without the support of evidence to the contrary, staff finds that the Board can **APPROVE** a Certificate of Appropriateness for **166 Avenida Menendez** with the following condition:

- The applicant shall provide photographs, specifications, or samples of the proposed materials for the rear porch and front porch and for the piers and lattice work in the foundation

Ex Parte Communication:

(None)

MOTION

Mr. Benoit **MOVED** to **APPROVE** application **F2018-0029** with the condition that the applicant shall provide photographs, specifications, or samples of the proposed materials for the rear porch and front porch and for the piers and lattice work in the foundation. The motion was **SECONDED** by Ms. Wingo.

VOTE ON MOTION:

AYES: Benoit, Wingo, Rumpel, Duncan

NAYES: NONE

MOTION CARRIED UNANIMOUSLY

**5. (b) Certificate of Appropriateness
F2018-0041 – Mary Baker – Applicant and
Owner
36 Treasury Street**

To construct a handicap ramp along the rear elevation.

Ms. Mitchell read the staff report and said based on a review of the AGHP and without the support of evidence to the contrary, staff finds that the Board can **APPROVE** a Certificate of Appropriateness for **36 Treasury Street** with the condition that:

- The applicant shall provide landscape plans that show the type of plants and the spacing and location of these plants at and around the base of the ramp. Native shrubs can provide a good option for the landscaping

Ex Parte Communication:

(None)

MOTION

Ms. Wingo **MOVED** to **APPROVE** application **F2018-0041** with the condition that the applicant shall provide landscape plans that show the type of plants and the spacing and location of these plants at and around the base of the ramp. Native shrubs can provide a good option for the landscaping. The motion was **SECONDED** by Mr. Rumpel.

VOTE ON MOTION:

AYES: Wingo, Rumpel, Benoit, Duncan

NAYES: NONE

MOTION CARRIED UNANIMOUSLY

**5. (c) Opinion of Appropriateness F2018-
0045 – Marquis Latimer + Halback, Inc. –
Applicant
TITF/Department of the State – Owner
22 St. George Street**

To install new gates, a 6 foot tall fence, a parking lot, lighting, and pathways and to create a garden and interpretive area using landscaping and other elements.

Ms. Mitchell read the staff report and said based on a review of the AGHP and without the support of evidence to the contrary, staff finds that the Board can **APPROVE** an Opinion of Appropriateness for **22 St. George Street**.

Freemont Latimer waived his presentation.

Ex Parte Communication:

(None)

MOTION

Ms. Wingo **MOVED** to **APPROVE** application F2018-0045. The motion was **SECONDED** by Mr. Benoit.

VOTE ON MOTION:

AYES: Wingo, Benoit, Rumpel, Duncan

NAYES: NONE

MOTION CARRIED UNANIMOUSLY

5. (d) Certificate of Appropriateness F2018-0044 – Marquis Latimer + Halback, Inc. – Applicant TITF/Department of the State – Owner 42 ½ St. George Street

To construct a walk-in cooler and a fence and alter the landscape site.

Ms. Mitchell read the staff report and said based on a review of the AGHP and without the support of evidence to the contrary, staff finds that the Board can **APPROVE** a Certificate of Appropriateness for 42 ½ King Street with the following conditions:

1. The cooler is painted one color to make it more compatible with the main structure
2. The width of the gate, which should be at least forty-four inches, is made compatible with the widths provided in the AGHP

Freemont Latimer agreed to staff conditions and waived his presentation.

Ex Parte Communication:

(None)

MOTION

Mr. Benoit **MOVED** to **APPROVE** application F2018-0044 with the conditions that the cooler is painted one color to make it more compatible with the main structure and the width of the gate, which should be at least forty-four inches, is made compatible with the widths provided in the AGHP. The motion was **SECONDED** by Mr. Rumpel.

VOTE ON MOTION:

AYES: Benoit, Rumpel, Wingo, Duncan

NAYES: NONE

MOTION CARRIED UNANIMOUSLY

6. Continued Items from Previous Meetings

6. (a) Certificate of Appropriateness F2018-0012 – Arcadian Development, LLC. – Applicant Red Moon Properties, LLC – Owner 9 Aviles Street

To alter the exterior façade to include replacing the stucco, windows, and doors; repairing the framing; and adding decorative details.

Applicant withdrew the application prior to the meeting.

6. (b) Certificate of Appropriateness F2018-0030 – Valerie Lee – Applicant Al Sabatino and Jeanne DeSmedt – Owner 123 Marine Street

To alter the current driveway and add new landscaping and two (4) foot high fences.

Ms. Mitchell read the staff report and said based on a review of the AGHP and without the support of evidence to the contrary, staff

finds that the Board can **APPROVE** a Certificate of Appropriateness for **123 Marine Street** with the following conditions:

- The applicant shall provide drawings of the proposed gate as well as material information about the side walkways, sitting areas, and the clay brick pavers
- The applicant shall select a more compatible material for PVC Fence and the grass
- The driveway will be reconfigured to preserve the relationship between the building and the grounds
- The applicant shall receive approval from the city to develop in the right of way and on city land

Valerie Lee reviewed the application.

Ex Parte Communication:

(None)

Public hearing was opened.

B.J. Kalaidi asked for clarification regarding the expedited hearing items and whether the applicant could have qualified to be included in that section if she had provided further details in advance.

Jeanne DeSmedt, owner of the subject property, noted that the rounded portion of the driveway was added to increase available parking since the curb in front of the house had been recently painted yellow, thus eliminating their on-street parking option.

Lee Geanuleas wanted to verify that the Board was aware of the unimproved right-of-way near the property to which the Board responded affirmatively, noting that the applicant had altered the application from the previous meeting to remove encroachments onto that right-of-way.

Public Hearing was closed.

Ms. Lee responded to public comment regarding expedited hearings.

The Board discussed:

- Reconfiguration of the driveway
- Concern for too much pavement in the front with the circular driveway and eliminating the circular portion the driveway
- Lack of vertical plantings in front of the house
- Recommendation to add trees to the front of the yard such as legustrums or grapefruit, or any tree that would grow up to the roofline
- No longer adding additional PVC fencing
- Grass needed to be specified

MOTION

Mr. Rumpel MOVED to APPROVE Certificate of Appropriateness application F2018-0030 with the conditions that the curved portion of the driveway in the front of the house is eliminated and there are at least three vertical plantings/trees that meet the landscaping requirements to be submitted and approved by staff. The motion was SECONDED by Mr. Benoit.

VOTE ON MOTION:

AYES: Rumpel, Benoit, Wingo, Duncan

NAYES: NONE

MOTION CARRIED UNANIMOUSLY

6. (c) Certificate of Demolition F2018-0005 – Kenneth K. Meiring – Applicant
Kenneth P. Meiring and Patricia M. Meiring – Owner
103 South Street

To demolish a building constructed in 1910 that is recorded on the Florida Master Site File and is a contributing building in the Lincolnville Historic

District. (Determined to be substantially damaged by City Building Official.)

Ms. Mitchell read the staff report and said based on a review of the AGHP and without the support of evidence to the contrary, staff finds that the Board can **APPROVE** a Certificate of Demolition for **103 South Street** with the following condition:

- Recording of the structure for archival purposes prior to demolition to include photographs and measured drawings that will be submitted by the applicant to the Florida Master Site File with a courtesy copy provided to staff

Kenneth Meiring was available for questions.

Ex Parte Communication:

(None)

24 certified notices were sent, 3 were returned in favor, 0 were returned opposed and 0 had comments.

Public hearing was opened.

B.J. Kalaidi asked about Code Enforcement issues and felt that the structure had been neglected to the point of requiring a demolition.

Public hearing was closed.

The Board discussed:

- Condition assessment
- Possible sale conditions
- Flooding of the structure
- Engineering letter which noted roof damage which caused additional building damage
- Applicant had not utilized the property since purchase

MOTION

Mr. Benoit MOVED to APPROVE application F2018-0005 with the condition that the applicant provide photographs and measured drawings to staff for the Florida Master Site File. Motion SECONDED by Mr. Rumpel.

VOTE ON MOTION:

AYES: Benoit, Rumpel, Wingo, Duncan

NAYES: NONE

MOTION CARRIED UNANIMOUSLY

6. (d) Opinion of Appropriateness F2017-0153 – Don Crichlow & Assoc. – Applicant
18 St. George Street LLC. – Owner
18 St. George Street

To construct new buildings between Spanish and St. George set in the character of the Spanish Colonial Architecture. (Two versions of the proposed building were provided.)

Applicant requested continuance of item prior to the meeting. See Modifications to the Agenda for motion to continue.

7. Opinion of Appropriateness

7. (a) 2018-0042 – Keith Andrews – Applicant
Keith and Tina Andrews – Owner
156 Avenida Menendez

To construct a two story porch on the front façade, to replace existing windows with porch entries and new windows, and to paint the structure using pre-approved paint colors.

Heard prior to Other Business to allow the applicant time to appear.

Ms. Mitchell read the staff report and said based on a review of the AGHP and without the support of evidence to the contrary, staff finds that the Board can **DENY** an Opinion of Appropriateness for **156 Avenida Menendez** as the proposed design does not

meet Secretary of Interior Standards 2 and 3.

Keith Andrews reviewed the application.

Ex Parte Communication:

(None)

Public hearing was opened; however, there was no response.

The Board discussed:

- Proposed porch and French doors did not match the existing structure in architectural style
- Railings could include aluminum scrollwork to match details in existing house
- Possibility of working with staff to find a compatible porch and window design
- Porch has potential to protect building from weather damage
- Marine Street and Bayfront sides of the house with very different architectural styles

MOTION

Mr. Benoit **MOVED** to **CONTINUE** application 2018-0042 to the June 21, 2018 meeting to allow the applicant time to update the drawings. The motion was **SECONDED** by Ms. Wingo.

VOTE ON MOTION:

AYES: Benoit, Wingo, Rumpel, Duncan

NAYES: NONE

MOTION CARRIED UNANIMOUSLY

8. Certificate of Appropriateness

8. (a) 2018-0039 – Lightner Museum – Applicant
Trustees of the Lightner Museum – Owner
75 King Street

To renovate the Faith Statue pedestal by removing the existing stucco and cap lip, installing new trim in the cornice and base, and installing new stucco.

Ms. Mitchell read the staff report and said based on a review of the AGHP and without the support of evidence to the contrary, staff finds that the Board can **CONTINUE** a Certificate of Appropriateness for **75 King Street** to allow the applicant to provide further information about the stucco and decorative detailing.

Bob Harper briefly reviewed the application.

Ex Parte Communication:

(None)

Public hearing was opened; however, there was no response.

The Board discussed:

- Red in the drawing to emulate terra cotta that would match the adjacent building
- Pedestal would be a gray stucco
- Desire to see sample of the colored concrete
- Same size and scale of the existing pedestal

MOTION

Mr. Benoit **MOVED** to **APPROVE** Certificate of Appropriateness application 2018-0039 with the condition that the applicant provide staff a tangible or photographic sample of what the trim color will be matched to and that the stucco is a plain sand finished stucco to match the adjacent building. The motion was **SECONDED** by Ms. Wingo.

VOTE ON MOTION:

AYES: Benoit, Wingo, Rumpel, Duncan

NAYES: NONE

MOTION CARRIED UNANIMOUSLY

8. (b) 2018-0043 – Les Thomas Architect
– Applicant
Scott and Susan Bebry – Owner
154 Avenida Menendez

To construct a second story rear addition, an addition to the third floor attic, a roof deck, and a guest house; to install new stairs, a ramp, a side porch, block piers, wood lattice work, and new handrails; to remove a single dormer; and to remove and the replace the existing rear door and window.

Ms. Mitchell read the staff report and said based on a review of the AGHP and without the support of evidence to the contrary, staff finds that the Board can **APPROVE** a Certificate of Appropriateness for **154 Avenida Menendez** on the following conditions:

- The applicant shall redesign the windows in the additions to differentiate them from the originals and redesign the sliding door to make it more compatible with the building
- The applicant shall provide necessary information and drawings for the shingles, lights, and gate

Les Thomas reviewed the application.

Ex Parte Communication:

(None)

Public hearing was opened; however, there was no response.

The Board discussed:

- Windows were six lite windows with two over two lite windows for the guest home to differentiate it from the main structure

- Differentiating but also matching newer doors and windows from the original structure
- The circular staircase

MOTION

Mr. Benoit **MOVED** to **APPROVE** Certificate of Appropriateness application 2018-0043 with the conditions that staff review and approve the final window configuration for the additions as shown in the presentation today and provide the locations for the light fixtures upon submittal for the building permit. The motion was **SECONDED** by Mr. Rumpel.

VOTE ON MOTION:

AYES: Benoit, Rumpel, Wingo, Duncan

NAYES: NONE

MOTION CARRIED UNANIMOUSLY

8. (c) 2018-0046 – Les Thomas Architect
– Applicant
St. Augustine Historical Tours, Inc. –
Owner
31 Orange Street

To construct a new addition and a bay window and to install new windows, wood siding, and metal awnings with brackets on a building that faces the HP-3 zoning district.

Ms. Mitchell read the staff report and said based on a review of the AGHP and without the support of evidence to the contrary, staff finds that the Board can **CONTINUE** a Certificate of Appropriateness for **31 Orange Street** to allow the applicant time to provide missing information and consider redesigning conjectural elements.

Mr. Benoit recused himself as a contractor on the project.¹

Les Thomas and Stacy Johnson reviewed the application.

¹ Form attached to original minutes

Ex Parte Communication:

(None)

Public hearing was opened; however, there was no response.

The Board discussed:

- Signage
- Concern for the length of the proposed wooden wall along east elevation
- Plans altered to change transom to store-front windows
- Proposed windows

MOTION

Mr. Rumpel MOVED to APPROVE application 2018-0046 as presented and the condition that the applicant agree to any necessary archeological review. The motion was SECONDED by Ms. Wingo.

VOTE ON MOTION:

AYES: Rumpel, Wingo, Duncan

NAYES: NONE

MOTION CARRIED UNANIMOUSLY

9. Variance to the Design Standards for Entry Corridors

9. (a) 2018-0047 – Joanna Stark – Applicant
Diocese of St. Augustine – Owner
101 San Marco Avenue

To request a variance to the sign standards for a free standing sign that exceeds the maximum size allowed in the Design Standards.

Ms. Wolfe read the staff report and said based on a review of the DSEC and applicable city ordinances staff finds that the Board can **APPROVE** the Variance if it makes the following findings for the signage at **101 San Marco Avenue**:

- A finding that the stand-alone sign at the central entry does not interfere with the property's setting and sightline towards the bridge and Great Cross because it is set back on the property
- A finding that the northwest sign is an integral component of a proposed fence system and that the sign area can be calculated as the smallest geometric shape surrounding the letters (shown at 2' 5 1/2" high and 8' wide = ~20 sq ft)
- A finding that granting the variance will not be contrary to the public interest; will not adversely affect other property and structures in the corridor; and will be in harmony with the spirit, intent, and purpose of this provision

Brad Leech and Joanna Stark reviewed the application.

Ex Parte Communication:

(None)

36 certified notices were sent, 5 were returned in favor and 2 had comments.

Public hearing was opened.

Lee McGowan spoke in favor of the application.

Public hearing was closed.

The Board discussed:

- Lack of necessity for the variance
- Possibility of maintaining the smaller sign's scale at both proposed locations
- Portion of the proposed fence along the Corner of Ocean Avenue and San Marco would include the monument wall signage

- How the proposed sign in the roundabout may change the view-scape into the property

Ms. Stark explained that the view of the bridge and cross were considered in the design of the roundabout sign.

Board discussion continued regarding:

- Redesigning the roundabout sign to be smaller in scale and lower in height
- Desire to see proposed streetscape that showed the sign's relationship with the streetscape and landmarks on the property
- Desire to see details regarding the fence and how the proposed signage tied into the rhythm of the fence

MOTION

Mr. Benoit MOVED to CONTINUE application 2018-0047 to the May 24, 2018 meeting with the recommendations that the applicant show how the corner sign ties into the perimeter fencing and that the radius signed be scaled down. The motion was SECONDED by Ms. Wingo.

VOTE ON MOTION:

AYES: Benoit, Wingo, Rumpel, Duncan

NAYES: NONE

MOTION CARRIED UNANIMOUSLY

10. Other Business

Ms. Wolfe announced that May was Historic Preservation Month and a Proclamation would be read at the May 14, 2018 Commission Meeting.

Ms. Wolfe also reminded the Board of training scheduled for May 21, 2018 provided by the National Alliance of Preservation Commissions. She also noted the Historic Trust Conference was May 7-9,

2018 in Jacksonville and Wednesday and Thursday, April 25-26, 2018 the Florida Association of Museum would be holding a hands-on and certified local government training at the Lightner Museum.

Ms. Wolfe also announced the Waterworks Building Open House on Saturday May 26, 2018.


There was brief discussion regarding the procedures for expedited hearing items.

11. Review of Conflict Statements from Previous Meetings

(None)

12. Adjournment

There being no further business, the meeting was adjourned at 3:37 P.M.²


Antoinette Wallace, Chairperson

² Transcribed by Candice Seymour